

# Common Core Social Studies Learning Plan Template

**Lesson Title:** Reparations For Slavery

**Author Name:** Denise Paxton

**Contact Information:** Dpaxton@washoeschools.net

**Appropriate for Grade Level(s):** 5-8

**History Standard(s)/Applicable CCSS(s) (RI, W, S&L, L):**

*H1.5.6* Identify individuals and groups responsible for founding and settling the American colonies.

*H1.5.7* Examine the cultural exchange among the Native Americans, Europeans, and Africans.

*H2.5.2* Describe issues of compromise and conflict within the United States.

*H2.5.4* Explain why slavery was introduced into colonial America.

*H2.5.5* Explain how the interactions among Native Americans, Africans, and Europeans, during colonial America resulted in unique economic, social, and political **institutions**.

*H3.5.3* Describe ways individuals display **social responsibility**.

*G6.5.2* Identify U. S. **regions** in which historical events occurred, i.e., thirteen colonies, Underground Railroad, and California gold fields.

*G6.5.3* Provide examples of **cultural identity in communities or regions** from different perspectives.

*E9.5.4* Describe how **income** reflects **choices** people make about education, training, skill development, lifestyle, and careers.

*C15.5.3* Give examples of national **interest groups**.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.5.1 Quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.5.3 Explain the relationships or interactions between two or more individuals, events, ideas, or concepts in a historical, scientific, or technical text based on specific information in the text.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.5.4 Determine the meaning of general academic and domain-specific words and phrases in a text relevant to a *grade 5 topic or subject area*.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.5.6 Analyze multiple accounts of the same event or topic, noting important similarities and differences in the point of view they represent.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.5.8 Explain how an author uses reasons and evidence to support particular points in a text, identifying which reasons and evidence support which point(s).

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.5.1 Write opinion pieces on topics or texts, supporting a point of view with reasons and information.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.5.4 Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development and organization are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (Grade-specific expectations for writing types are defined in standards 1–3 above.)

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.5.9 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.5.1 Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on *grade 5 topics and texts*, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.5.3 Summarize the points a speaker makes and explain how each claim is supported by reasons and evidence.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.5.4 Report on a topic or text or present an opinion, sequencing ideas logically and using appropriate facts and relevant, descriptive details to support main ideas or themes; speak clearly at an understandable pace.

**Type of Lesson:** Close Reading with Socratic Seminar Discussion

---

*The pages that follow the Learning Plan Template includes student readings and reading strategy/questions, source(s), handouts, assignment sheet, self-assessment/reflection and a rubric related to this lesson.*

**Student Readings (list):** Reparations for Slavery? (Constitutional Rights Foundation)

**Total Time Needed:** Four to Five 45 minute periods

**Materials:** Chart paper to cover tables during Day 5 Discussion, Reparations for Slavery? packet (Text, text dependent questions, “Keep It” “Junk It” evidence sheet, and Evidence categories sheet), Socratic Seminar Ticket copied onto 11 X 17 paper , Observation Form, Accountable Talk Handout, Rubric, Opinion Writing Handout

**Lesson Outline:**

<b>Time Frame</b> (e.g. 15 minutes)	<b>What is the teacher doing?</b>	<b>What are students doing?</b>
15-45 min.	Teacher preteaches the students the concept of “Racism.” Time depends on the lesson.	
Day 1: 10 min.	Teacher passes out Reparations for Slavery? Text to students. Direct students to preview underlined vocabulary and their meanings.	Students identify underlined words in the text and read the meanings from the vocabulary box.
10 min.	Teacher directs students to read through the text.	Students read through the text.
10 min.	Teacher reads the text aloud to students.	Students follow along as the teacher reads the text aloud.
15 min.	Teacher reviews Text Annotation Marks. Direct students to reread the text and make text annotations as they read. Monitor student’s progress with text annotation.	Students read through the text making the following annotations: * important part, ! surprising part, ? questions you have,  making connections. Students should also make notations about their annotations.
Day 2: 30 min.	Teacher directs students to read the text a third time answering the questions while they read. Teacher may want to pull a small group for students that need more support.	Students read through the text and answer the questions as they read.
15 min.	Teacher puts students into small groups and directs the groups to discuss the answers to their questions. Teacher monitors small group discussion.	Students discuss the questions in their small groups. Students make changes to their answers based on the group discussion.
Day 3: 15 mi.	Teacher directs students to read through the text identifying evidence that answers the question, “Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13 <sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustice of slavery?” Depending on the level of your students, teacher may need to do some vocabulary work with the question. Teacher monitors student’s identification of evidence. For students that need more support, direct them to the <b>Reparations, Pro and Con</b> section of the text.	Students read through the text and make a list of evidence that answers the question: “Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13 <sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustice of slavery?” Student will list their evidence, line number they found the evidence, and explain why it is evidence that answers the question above.
15 min.	Teacher puts students in partners. Teacher directs students to work together going through	Partners work together going through their evidence. If they both agree that it is evidence

*The pages that follow the Learning Plan Template includes student readings and reading strategy/questions, source(s), handouts, assignment sheet, self-assessment/reflection and a rubric related to this lesson.*

	<p>their evidence. If they both agree that it is evidence that answers the question , they “Keep It”. If they disagree, they “Junk It” cross it out. Teacher monitors partners’ discussions and is the tie breaker when partners disagree whether to “Keep It” or “Junk It”.</p>	<p>that answers the question , they “Keep It’. If they disagree, they “Junk It” cross it out.</p>
15 min.	<p>Teacher directs partners to categorize their evidence. Teacher monitors students’ process of categorizing information.</p>	<p>Students create categories for their evidence. They label each category, list the evidence and the line number.</p>
Day 4:		
30 min.	<p>Teacher directs students to complete their Socratic Seminar Ticket. Remind students not to forget to write 4 questions they would like to ask during the discussion. The ticket is the entry to the class discussion the following day. You may assign this as homework instead of using class instructional time.</p>	<p>Students complete the Reparations for Slavery? Seminar Ticket. They will be using the ticket and the text during the Socratic Seminar Discussion the following day.</p>
Day 5. 30 min.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Teacher arranges the room into either one big group (connect desks and tables) or two smaller groups. Small groups allows for more opportunity for shyer students to participate.</li> <li>2. Teacher places 4 desks at the corners for the large group or two desks at opposing corners for the small group.</li> <li>3. Place chart paper to cover the tables. Teacher checks to make sure all students have completed their Seminar Ticket.</li> <li>4. Instruct students that have their completed ticket to take a seat at the discussion table with their text, ticket, Accountable Talk Form, and pencil to take additional notes during the discussion.</li> <li>5. Students that were absent or did not complete the ticket sit at the desks at the corner to be observers (ask for volunteers if necessary). Assign them students that are sitting close to each other and easy to observe for them to observe.</li> <li>6. Give observers Observation Form.</li> <li>7. Pass out 4 pieces of candy to each student at the discussion table. Instruct them at each time they share in the discussion, they will pull a piece of candy to eat later. Once candies are gone, they cannot share any more.</li> <li>8. Tell students they may make notes on the chart paper when they hear something in the discussion they want to remember. NO DOODLING! After the discussion they will be able to transfer the notes on the chart paper to their Seminar Ticket notes.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. Students come take a seat at the discussion tables with their text, ticket, Accountable Talk, and pencil.</li> <li>5. Student Observers sit at a desk with Observation Form and pencil. Observers will observe a group of students and use the Observation Form to collect data on the student’s participation in the discussion.</li> </ol>

*The pages that follow the Learning Plan Template includes student readings and reading strategy/questions, source(s), handouts, assignment sheet, self-assessment/reflection and a rubric related to this lesson.*

	9. Read the Discussion Question allowed and instruct students to begin discussing. Remind them to use Accountable Talk and refer to the evidence in the text when they share.	
	10. Monitor the discussion. Only intervene to clarify information being shared. 11. End the discussion before the students end the discussion. This keeps them wanting more. 12. Assign observers to review their data and prepare to share with the group. 13. Pass out Socratic Seminar Rubric to discussion students. Students rate themselves based on their participation. Set goals for the next discussion. 14. Observers share their data. 15. Teacher pulls the groups together and have students summarize important points from the discussion.	10. Students begin the discussion using evidence from the text and reasoning to support their answer. Students will begin their responses using an Account Talk. Students make notes on the chart paper of information they want to add to their discussion ticket notes. Each time a student shares in the discussion, the student pulls a piece of candy towards them. Once all four pieces are pulled, the student may not share anymore. 13. Student rate themselves using the Seminar Rubric. Students set goals for the next discussion. 14. Students listen to observers data being shared. 15. Students summarize important points shared during the discussion as a whole class.
15 min.	Teacher passes out Writing Assignment/Assessment and directs students to use the evidence they located from the text and shared during discussion to answer the discussion question using Claims, Reasoning, and Evidence.	Students complete an opinion/persuasive piece of writing answering the discussion question. Student will use claims, reasoning, and evidence with their writing.

**Description of Lesson Assessment:** Opinion/Persuasive Writing: Students will complete an opinion/persuasive piece of writing answering the discussion question: “Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustice of slavery?” using claims, reasoning, and evidence.

**How will students reflect on the process and their learning?** Discussions during small groups, partners, and Socratic Seminar as well as the discussion rubric and writing assignment will give students opportunities to reflect on their learning.

# Reparations for Slavery? (Constitutional Rights Foundation)

Today, even after the success of the civil rights movement, the black American population on average has higher infant-mortality rates, lower life expectancy, higher rates of unemployment, lower income, and higher rates of imprisonment than the white population. Some argue that these problems are the "legacy of slavery" brought on by society's discrimination and racism.

Are the conditions really a "legacy of slavery"? If so, what should be done? Some African-Americans argue today for reparations--a sort of compensation for the free labor blacks were forced to render during 250 years of slavery.

## The Idea of Reparations

Reparations for slavery is not a new idea. Before the Civil War ended, General William Tecumseh Sherman issued an order in South Carolina. He wanted 40 acres and the loan of an Army mule set aside for each former slave family. This order was never carried out. After the war, Radical Republicans in Congress passed laws requiring confiscation of former-Confederate property to provide the ex-slaves with "40 acres and a mule." In 1866, President Andrew Johnson vetoed the legislation.

## The Conyers Bill

Rep. Conyers introduced his bill in November 1989. The preamble of the bill declared its purpose: *To acknowledge the fundamental injustice, cruelty, brutality and inhumanity of slavery in the United States and the 13 American colonies between 1619 and 1865 and to establish a Commission to examine the institution of slavery and economic discrimination against African-Americans, and the impact of these forces on living African-Americans, to make recommendations to the Congress on appropriate remedies, and for other purposes.* This bill failed to make it to a House vote, but Conyers did not give up.

Robert Brock argued for direct payments to descendants of slaves. "The government owes us money on a number of different fronts," the 66-year-old black activist declared, ". . . for labor, for loss of culture and of humanity."

Advocates are not unanimous about the form of reparations, neither are they united on the amount. Some favor direct payments to slave descendants ranging from \$25,000 to \$100,000 or more. Others believe a final amount cannot be determined until more study has been done to determine the harm slavery has caused blacks. But they suggest the total amount could be in the "trillions."

## Reparations, Pro and Con

Baby deaths

To give

To seize, take

To make laws

Proposed law

Effect  
To correct or fix

Relatives , in future generations

Supporter

\$1,000,000,000,000

38 Many people and groups have voiced their opposition to the whole idea of slavery  
39 reparations. Major arguments against reparations include:

To go against

- 40 • There are no black slaves living today. Slavery ended more than 160 years  
41 ago at the cost of several hundred thousand lives lost in the Civil War. It is  
42 unfair to ask American taxpayers, many of them from families that came to  
43 the United States after slavery ended, to pay for the wrongs of slavery.
- 44 • The problems faced by African Americans today are not the "legacy of  
45 slavery" or even racism. Many blacks have succeeded very well in  
46 American society. The problems of poor African Americans are caused by  
47 social ills within the inner city, such as the breakdown of families, high crime  
48 rates, and dependence on welfare.
- 49 • Federal and state governments have already spent billions of dollars on  
50 social programs such as welfare, subsidized housing, health care,  
51 employment development, affirmative action, and education. These  
52 programs have benefitted African Americans.
- 53 • African Americans, particularly the young, need to overcome their problems  
54 through their own efforts and not depend on more government handouts  
55 and benefits.
- 56 • Reparations would be too expensive, depriving the country of the  
57 opportunity to fix the Social Security and Medicare systems and meet other  
58 budget needs that benefit all Americans.
- 59 • Any reparation plan would lead to unfairness and huge administrative costs.  
60 Who would receive reparations? Descendants of slaves? All blacks? Would  
61 well-off African Americans receive payments? If a fund were set up, who  
62 would administer it? Would those unhappy with the plan call for even more  
63 reparations or file lawsuits?

Problems

withholding

64 Advocates for reparations reject these arguments. They contend:

Believe

- 65 • The claim for reparations is not against white Americans or even individual  
66 Americans. It is a claim against American government and society, which  
67 has continued from the time of slavery. As all members of society share in  
68 society's benefits, they also must share the burdens in the form of taxation.  
69 Through slavery, African Americans were terribly wronged and modern  
70 blacks were robbed of their inheritance. Further, blacks face racism every  
71 day. They deserve to be compensated.
- 72 • The problems faced by many blacks today come from slavery and society's  
73 ongoing racism. Blacks were uprooted from their homes in Africa and  
74 brutalized in America by a system that destroyed the family structure and  
75 degraded the individual. When slavery ended, African Americans owned  
76 nothing. Isolated and discriminated against, they were denied education,  
77 contacts with society, and economic opportunity. Compared to whites,  
78 blacks remain in a disadvantaged position and will remain so until they  
79 receive compensation and society's racism ends.
- 80 • Welfare, subsidized housing, affirmative action, and other previous efforts to  
81 address socio-economic problems of the black underclass have been too  
82 little and too late. They failed because society has failed to come to grips

Troubles, problems

83 with the central problem--its own racism and discrimination. In some cases,  
84 social programs, though well-intentioned, actually increased black isolation  
85 and further degraded the black community. In addition, these programs  
86 benefitted other groups, not just blacks. By doing so, they failed to address  
87 the unique claims based on slavery that African-Americans have.

- 88 • Reparations will not promote dependency. Instead, they will give individual  
89 African Americans and the community as a whole a chance to create their  
90 own economic base and become self-reliant.
- 91 • The cost of reparations may be great, but a debt is owed and must be paid.  
92 The moral claim for reparations at least equals that of any other government  
93 program. America is a rich country, and if the will exists, the money can be  
94 found.
- 95 • Just as it is too early to decide how much is due in reparations, it is too early  
96 to agree on how to distribute the reparations. Fair methods can be worked  
97 out once society acknowledges its obligation to provide reparations in the  
98 first place.

99 While it is unclear whether those advocating reparations for slavery ever will be  
100 successful, it is likely the debate will go on.

Relying on others for  
support, money

give out

Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustice of slavery?

## Reparations for Slavery

1. Read the excerpt *Reparations for Slavery*?
2. The author defines reparations in the second paragraph. Define reparations in your own words based upon this definition.
3. Highlight key words from the text that connect with reparations for slavery.
4. What do we learn about the black American population in the first paragraph?

How does this information relate to the phrase in line 2 “even after the success of the civil rights movement”?

5. When did the idea of reparations first appear?

What ideas about reparations were there?

6. Representative Convers introduced a reparations bill 133 years after Congress passed a reparations law that was vetoed by President Johnson. What were the three main ideas in the Convers bill?
  - a.
  - b.
  - c.
7. The word “unanimous” appears on line 34. What context clues in the paragraph help you better understand the phrase “advocates are no unanimous”?

8. Using the rules for paraphrasing (below), work with a partner to put each of the arguments for and against reparations in your own words in the T-Chart.

Paraphrase:

- a. Change the structure of the sentence/section—start and end in a different way.
- b. Change the words so that they are your own.
- c. Check to make sure that no more than three words in a row are copied.

Opposition to Reparations	Support of Reparations



Discussion Questions:

Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustices of slavery?

- With a partner, go over your evidence and create categories for your evidence. Label the title for each category. Write the evidence and the line number.


# Reparations for Slavery?

Use the text to cite evidence that answers the question;

Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustices of slavery?

Socratic Seminar Ticket

Line #	Text Evidence in Support of Reparations	Line #	Text Evidence in Opposition of Reparations

Questions I would like to ask about Reparations of Slavery.

1. \_\_\_\_\_
2. \_\_\_\_\_
3. \_\_\_\_\_
4. \_\_\_\_\_

**Socratic Seminar OBSERVATION Form**

Your Name: \_\_\_\_\_

*Directions: Each time a participant does one of the following put a check in the box.*

**Speaks in discussion:**

<b>Student Name</b>								
<b>Speaks in discussion:</b>								
<b>Refers to a line or specific point in the text:</b>								
<b>Asks a NEW question:</b>								
<b>Asks a FOLLOW-UP or CLARIFYING question:</b>								
<b>Interrupts another speaker:</b>								
<b>Engages in side conversations:</b>								

**Overall how well did the participants discuss the question “Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustices of slavery?”**

**Use evidence from your data above.**

# Socratic Seminar

## Self-Evaluation

Your participation leads to the group's deeper understanding of the themes and ideas.

	Beginning	Developing	Accomplished	Exemplary
Gives evidence and makes inferences.	Locates factual evidence with page number.	Locates evidence in support of an idea under discussion.	Uses evidence in the text to expand on, analyze or critique an idea.	Uses evidence in the text to create a new idea or draw connections among ideas.
Asks questions which lead to rich discussion and deeper group understanding.	Asks a question related to the current discussion.	Asks questions that evoke deeper responses from others.	Asks questions that connect ideas in the current discussion to previous comments.	Asks questions that relate the current discussion to bigger themes or ideas.
Acts in ways which contribute to building a group that is collaboratively searching for meaning.	Listens to others.	Asks questions to clarify what someone has said	Builds on another person's idea.	Connects the ideas of several students.

[Debbie Ablock](#)

© Grand Conversations

NoodleTools/NoodleTeach: Socratic Seminar Rubric

<http://www.NoodleTools.com/debbie/theracles/basic/1/C6wh/55rubric.pdf>

© August 22, 2000, latest revision 7/29/08

## Claims/Evidence:

### Definitions:

Claim: to assert or maintain **as** a fact: *She claimed that he was telling the truth.*

Evidence: **that** **which** tends to prove or disprove something; ground for belief; proof.

Reasoning: an **explanation** of how **your evidence** connects to proving **your claim**.

### Sentence Starters for Reasoning:

This proves... This highlights...

This shows... This illuminates...

This demonstrates...

1. You will create/formulate a claim.
2. You will list three pieces of evidence to support your claim.
3. You will explain how your evidence proves your claim through reasoning.
4. You will write a 5-7 sentence Summary of your claim and why the evidence you found supports your claim.

Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustices of slavery?

Please State your Claim: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Evidence 1: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Reasoning 1: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Evidence 2: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Reasoning 2: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Evidence 3: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Reasoning 3: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustices of slavery?

**Summary:** \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

- Conventions Rubric:**
- \_\_\_ I checked all spelling.
  - \_\_\_ I checked all punctuation.
  - \_\_\_ I checked all Capitalization.
  - \_\_\_ I checked for complete sentences and grammar.

- Idea Rubric:**
- \_\_\_ I wrote about something I know.
  - \_\_\_ I stayed on topic (claim).
  - \_\_\_ I used details and descriptions as evidence to support and explain my claim.

Since reparations were not granted following the passage of the 13<sup>th</sup> Amendment, should black Americans be granted reparations as compensation for the injustices of slavery?

## ***(5<sup>th</sup> Grade Student Writing Sample)***

### **Summary:**

Reparations are not a good idea, even if whites and black weren't being treated the same way. Reparations are too expensive, depriving the opportunity to fix social security and Medicare systems. This highlights the fact that the budget for reparations has to benefit all Americans. The government already spent too much money on social programs to help blacks and whites have equal rights, and not be judged by their wealthiness. This demonstrates that even though the government was trying to give blacks and whites equal rights, society failed to do so. Blacks need to overcome their own problems and not rely on the government's handouts and benefits. This shows that blacks have to share society's benefits, and should not rely on the government to help them.

---

### **Conventions Rubric:**

- I checked all spelling.
- I checked all punctuation.
- I checked all Capitalization.
- I checked for complete sentences and grammar.

### **Idea Rubric:**

- I wrote about something I know.
- I stayed on topic (claim).
- I used details and descriptions from the text as evidence to support and explain my claim.
- I explained my evidence using reasoning.