Common Core Social Studies Learning Plan Template

**Lesson Title:** Battle for the Best: Comparative study of Athens, Sparta and Rome

**Author Name:** Sue Gonyou

**Contact Information:** Mendive M.S. – G.T. Magnet Program

**Appropriate for Grade Level(s):** 6-10

**History Standard(s)/Applicable CCSS(s) (RI, W, S&L, L):** [Type text]

**Type of Lesson:** DBQ and debates

**Student Readings (list):** Roman excellence

<http://wps.pearsoncustom.com/wps/media/objects/2426/2484749/chap_assets/documents/doc6_4.html>

<http://wps.pearsoncustom.com/wps/media/objects/2426/2484749/chap_assets/documents/doc6_6.html>

Greek excellence – Athens

<http://wps.pearsoncustom.com/wps/media/objects/2426/2484749/chap_assets/documents/doc5_3.html>

Greek excellence – Sparta

<http://wps.pearsoncustom.com/wps/media/objects/2426/2484749/chap_assets/documents/doc5_4.html>

Optional sources: DBQ Project (“Athens and Rome”; “Sparta”)

**Total Time Needed:** 4 class periods (60 minutes each)

**Lesson Outline:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Time Frame**  **(e.g. 15 minutes)** | **What is the teacher doing?** | **What are students doing?** |
| 15 minutes | Discussion – Who is the best musician? | Sharing their choices; identify characteristics that classify something as best |
| 45 minutes | 1. Overview of task – (debating on Athens, Sparta and Rome as candidates for the best ancient city with a panel of judges who will evaluate the quality of debate) 2. Facilitate for careful read of documents with vocabulary development; provide background for the primary documents (see web links) 3. Selecting a panel to evaluate | Clarifying questions; what might be characteristics that define quality in a city?  Careful read of documents with vocabulary development; complete teacher created note-taker (**panel will study the basic document for Athens, Sparta and Rome**) |
| 60 minutes | Monitor research and support | Research, using ABC-CLIO to support their nations supremacy in the ancient world  (**Panel will finish the previous day task; they will determine a note-taker that they will use to evaluate each debate – copies will be made prior to the debate**) |
| 60 minutes | Monitoring the creation of debate positions, support and presentations | Each group will develop their strategy for debate;  They will create a note-taker and assign two students to each section; students create their individual arguments – practice citing sources that respond to each question – each group develops a brief presentation (**Panel will meet with teacher to review note-taker and create the final form)** |
| 45 minutes | Teacher leads a debate | Each group has up to 5 minutes to present their position – while each group presents, the other two groups listen and take notes - after all three have presented, each group has 6 minutes to prepare a rebuttal and up to 2 minutes each for response (Panel will evaluate the teams by the number of quality supports that are text specific) |
| 20-30 minutes |  | Reflective homework |

**Description of Lesson Assessment:** The debate itself will allow each team to present, a brief period to prepare for rebuttal, and another opportunity to present. There will be 3 teams presenting and a 4th group will be panel judges. They determine which group provided the best substantiation for their position. There will be 5 judges and 8 representing each ancient culture. (This varies with each class)

**How will students reflect on the process and their learning?** Students will create a reflective piece in which they assess which group, other than their own, validated their position best. They must support why they picked one group over the other, citing details from the debate.

**The Spartan document**

Among the many innovations which Lycurgus made, the first and most important was his institution of a senate, or Council of Elders, which, as Plato says, by being blended with the "feverish" government of the kings, and by having an equal vote with them in matters of the highest importance, brought safety and due moderation into counsels of state. For before this the civil polity was veering and unsteady, inclining at one time to follow the kings towards **tyranny**, and at another to follow the multitude towards democracy; but now, by making the power of the senate a sort of ballast for the ship of state and putting her on a steady keel, it achieved the safest and the most orderly arrangement, since the twenty-eight senators always took the side of the kings when it was a question of curbing democracy, and, on the other hand, always strengthened the people to withstand the **encroachments** *(invasions or intrusions)*of tyranny.   
  
[*Sparta's assemblies met between a bridge and a river*.]   
  
…Between these they held their assemblies, having neither halls nor any other kind of building for the purpose. For by such things Lycurgus thought good counsel was not promoted, but rather discouraged, since the serious purposes of an assembly were rendered foolish and futile by vain thoughts, as they gazed upon statues and paintings, or scenic **embellishments**, or extravagantly decorated roofs of council halls. When the multitude was thus assembled, no one of them was permitted to make a motion, but the motion laid before them by the senators and kings could be accepted or rejected by the people. Afterwards, however, when the people by additions and subtractions perverted and distorted the sense of motions laid before them, Kings Polydorus and Theopompus inserted this clause into the rhetra: "But if the people should adopt a distorted motion, the senators and kings shall have power of adjournment"; that is, should not ratify the vote, but dismiss outright and dissolve the session, on the ground that it was perverting and changing the motion contrary to the best interests of the state.   
  
…A second, and a very bold political measure of Lycurgus, was his redistribution of the land. For there was a dreadful inequality in this regard, the city was heavily burdened with **indigent** *(poor)*and helpless people, and wealth was wholly concentrated in the hands of a few. Determined, therefore, to banish insolence and envy and crime and luxury, and those yet more deep-seated and afflictive diseases of the state, poverty and wealth, he persuaded his fellow-citizens to make one parcel of all their territory and divide it up anew, and to live with one another on a basis of entire uniformity and equality in the means of subsistence, seeking **preeminence** *(superiority)*through virtue alone, assured that there was no other difference or inequality between man and man than that which was established by blame for base actions and praise for good ones.   
  
Next, he undertook to divide up their movable property also, in order that every vestige of unevenness and inequality might be removed.…In the first place, he withdrew all gold and silver money from currency, and ordained the use of iron money only.   
  
In the next place, he banished the unnecessary and **superfluous** arts. And even without such banishment most of them would have departed with the old coinage, since there was no sale for their products. For the iron money could not be carried into the rest of Greece, nor had it any value there, but was rather held in ridicule. It was not possible, therefore, to buy any foreign wares or bric-à-brac; no merchant-seamen brought freight into their harbours; no rhetoric teacher set foot on **Laconian** soil, no vagabond soothsayer, no keeper of harlots, no gold- or silver-smith, since there was no money there. But luxury, thus gradually deprived of that which stimulated and supported it, died away of itself.   
  
With a view to attack luxury still more and remove the thirst for wealth, he introduced his third and most exquisite political device, namely, the institution of common **messes**, so that they might eat with one another in companies, of common and specified foods.…   
  
In the matter of education, which he regarded as the greatest and noblest task of the law-giver, he began at the very source, by carefully regulating marriages and births.…   
  
He made the maidens exercise their bodies in running, wrestling, casting the discus, and hurling the javelin, in order that the fruit of their wombs might have vigorous root in vigorous bodies and come to better maturity, and that they themselves might come with vigour to the fulness of their times, and struggle successfully and easily with the pangs of child-birth.…   
  
For their marriages the women were carried off by force, not when they were small and unfit for wedlock, but when they were in full bloom and wholly ripe.   
  
[*Children of Spartan citizens, especially the boys, were under the control of the city more so than under their parents.*]   
  
. . . as soon as [the boys] were seven years old, Lycurgus ordered them all to be taken by the state and enrolled in companies, where they were put under the same discipline and nurture, and so became accustomed to share one another's sports and studies.…   
  
Of reading and writing, they learned only enough to serve their turn; all the rest of their training was calculated to make them obey commands well, endure hardships, and conquer in battle. Therefore, as they grew in age, their bodily exercise was increased; their heads were close-clipped, and they were accustomed to going bare-foot, and to playing for the most part without clothes.…   
  
…The training of the Spartans lasted into the years of full maturity. No man was allowed to live as he pleased, but in their city, as in a military encampment, they always had a prescribed regimen and employment in public service, considering that they belonged entirely to their country and not to themselves.   
  
In a word, he trained his fellow-citizens to have neither the wish nor the ability to live for themselves; but like bees they were to make themselves always **integral** *(vital, key)*parts of the whole community, clustering together about their leader, almost beside themselves with enthusiasm and noble ambition, and to belong wholly to their country.…   
  
. . . he did not permit them to live abroad at their pleasure and wander in strange lands, assuming foreign habits and imitating the lives of peoples who were without training and lived under different forms of government. Nay more, he actually drove away from the city the multitudes which streamed in there for no useful purpose, not because he feared they might become imitators of his form of government and learn useful lessons in virtue, as Thucydides says, but rather that they might not become in any wise teachers of evil. For along with strange people, strange doctrines must come in; and novel doctrines bring novel decisions, from which there must arise many feelings and resolutions which destroy the harmony of the existing political order. Therefore he thought it more necessary to keep bad manners and customs from invading and filling the city than it was to keep out infectious diseases.   
  
Source: Plutarch, *Plutarch's Lives*, Vol. 1, trans. Bernadotte Perrin (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1914), pp. 219, 221, 223, 225, 227, 229, 231, 233, 241, 245, 247, 249, 257, 259, 279, 283, 289.

**Roman – document one**

"If one considers the vast extent of your empire he must be amazed that so small a fraction of it rules the world, but when he beholds the city and its spaciousness it is not astonishing that all the habitable world is ruled by such a capital. . . . Your possessions equal the sun's course. . . . You do not rule within fixed boundaries, nor can anyone dictate the limits of your **sway**. . . . Whatever any people produces can be found here, at all times and in abundance. . . . Egypt, Sicily, and the civilized part of Africa are your farms; ships are continually coming and going. . . .   
  
"Vast as it is, your empire is more remarkable for its thoroughness than its scope: there are no dissident or rebellious enclaves. . . . The whole world prays in unison that your empire may endure forever.   
  
"Governors sent out to cities and peoples each rule their charges, but in their relations to each other they are equally subjects. The principal difference between governors and their charges is this -- they demonstrate the proper way to be a subject. So great is their reverence for the great Ruler [the emperor], who administers all things. Him they believe to know their business better than they themselves do, and hence they respect and heed him more than one would a master overseeing a task and giving orders. No one is so self-assured that he can remain unmoved upon hearing the emperor's name: he rises in prayer and adoration and utters a twofold prayer -- to the gods for the Ruler, and to the Ruler for himself. And if the governors are in the least doubt concerning the justice of claims or suits of the governed, public or private, they send to the Ruler for instructions at once and await his reply, as a chorus awaits its trainer's directions. Hence the Ruler need not exhaust himself by traveling to various parts to settle matters in person. It is easy for him to abide in his place and manage the world through letters; these arrive almost as soon as written, as if borne on wings.   
  
"But the most marvelous and admirable achievement of all, and the one deserving our fullest gratitude, is this. . . . You alone of the imperial powers of history rule over men who are free. You have not assigned this or that region to this **nabob** *(a Muslim official)*or that mogul; no people has been turned over as a domestic and bound holding -- to a man not himself free. But just as citizens in an individual city might designate magistrates, so you, whose city is the whole world, appoint governors to protect and provide for the governed, as if they were elective, not to lord it over their charges. As a result, so far from disputing the office as if it were their own, governors make way for their successors readily when their term is up, and may not even await their coming. Appeals to a higher jurisdiction are as easy as appeals from parish to county. . . .   
  
"But the most notable and praiseworthy feature of all, a thing unparalleled, is your **magnanimous** conception of citizenship. All of your subjects (and this implies the whole world) you have divided into two parts: the better endowed and more virile, wherever they may be, you have granted citizenship and even kinship; the rest you govern as obedient subjects. Neither the seas nor expanse of land bars citizenship; Asia and Europe are not differentiated. Careers are open to talent. . . . Rich and poor find contentment and profit in your system; there is no other way of life. Your polity is a single and all-embracing harmony. . . .   
  
"You have not put walls around your city, as if you were hiding it or avoiding your subjects; to do so you considered ignoble and inconsistent with your principles, as if a master should show fear of his slaves. You did not overlook walls, however, but placed them round the empire, not the city. The splendid and distant walls you erected are worthy of you; to men within their circuit they are visible, but it requires a journey of months and years from the city to see them. Beyond the outermost ring of the civilized world you drew a second circle, larger in radius and easier to defend, like the outer fortifications of a city. Here you built walls and established cities in diverse parts. The cities you filled with colonists; you introduced arts and crafts and established an orderly culture. . . . Your military organization makes all others childish. Your soldiers and officers you train to prevail not only over the enemy but over themselves. The soldier lives under discipline daily, and none ever deserts the post assigned him.   
  
"You alone are, so to speak, natural rulers. Your predecessors were masters and slaves in turn; as rulers they were counterfeits, and reversed their positions like players in a ball game. . . . You have measured out the world, bridged rivers, cut roads through mountains, filled the wastes with posting stations, introduced orderly and refined modes of life. . . .   
  
"Be all gods and their offspring invoked to grant that this empire and this city flourish forever and never cease until stones float upon the sea and trees forbear to sprout in the springtide. May the great Ruler and his sons be preserved to administer all things well.

**Roman Document 2**

1. At the age of nineteen, on my owninitiative and at my own expense, I raised an army by means of which I liberated the Republic, which was oppressed by the tyranny of a faction. For which reason the senate, with honorific decrees, made me a member of its order . . . giving me at the same time consular rank in voting, and granted me the **imperium** *(Absolute power)*

. . .  
  
2. Those who assassinated my father I drove into exile, avenging their crime by due process of law; and afterwards when they waged war against the state, I conquered them twice on the battlefield.  
  
3. I waged many wars throughout the whole world by land and by sea, both civil and foreign, and when victorious I spared all citizens who sought pardon. Foreign peoples who could safely be pardoned I preferred to spare rather than to extirpate . . .  
  
8. . . . Three times I revised the roll of senators . . .  
  
15. To the Roman plebs I paid 300 sesterces apiece in accordance with the will of my father; and in my fifth consulship I gave each 400 sesterces in my own name out of the spoils of war . . .  
  
17. Four times I came to the assistance of the treasury with my own money, transferring to those in charge of the treasury 150,000,000 sesterces . . .  
  
22. I gave a gladiatorial show three times in my own name, and five times in the names of my sons or grandsons; at these shows about 10,000 fought . . .  
  
25. I brought peace to the sea by suppressing the pirates. In that way I turned over to their masters for punishment nearly 30,000 slaves who had run away from their owners and taken up arms against the state . . .  
  
26. I extended the frontiers of all the provinces of the Roman people on whose boundaries were peoples subject to our empire. . .  
  
28. I established colonies of soldiers in Africa, Sicily, Macedonia, in both Spanish provinces, in Achaea, Asia, Syria, Narbonese Gaul, and in Pisidia. . .  
  
31. Royal embassies from India, never previously seen before by any Roman general, were often sent to me.  
  
34. In my sixth and seventh consulships [28 and 27 B.C.E.] after I had put an end to the civil wars, having attained supreme power by universal consent, I transferred the state from my own power to the control of the Roman senate and people. For this service of mine I received the title of Augustus by decree of the senate.   
Source: *Roman Civilizations: Selected Readings, Vol. I*, ed. Naphtali Lewis and Meyer Reinhold (New York: Columbia University Press, 1955).

**Athens document**

"Our constitution does not copy the laws of neighboring states; we are rather a model for others than **imitators** ourselves. Its administration favors the many instead of the few; this is why it is called a democracy. If we look at the laws, they afford equal justice to all in settling private differences. As for prestige, advancement in public life goes to men with reputations for ability: class considerations are not allowed to interfere with merit, nor again does poverty bar the way. If a man is able to serve the state, he is not hindered by obscure origins or poverty. The freedom we enjoy in our government extends also to our private life. There . . . we do not feel called upon to be angry with our neighbor for doing what he likes, or even to indulge in those injurious looks which cannot fail to be offensive, although they inflict no actual harm. But all this ease in our private relations does not make us lawless as citizens. . . . We obey the magistrates and the laws, particularly those for the protection of the injured, whether they are actually on the statute book, or belong to that code which, although unwritten, yet cannot be broken without acknowledged disgrace.   
  
"Further, we provide plenty of means for the mind to refresh itself from business. We celebrate games and sacrifices all the year round, and the elegance of our private establishments forms a daily source of pleasure and helps to banish our cares. Then, too, the magnitude of our city draws the produce of the world into our harbor, so that to the Athenian the products of other countries are as familiar a luxury as those of his own.   
  
"If we turn to our military policy, there also we differ from our **antagonists**. We throw open our city to the world, and never pass laws to exclude foreigners from any opportunity of learning or observing, although the eyes of the enemy may occasionally profit from our liberality. . . . In education, where our rivals from their very cradles seek after manliness through a very painful discipline, at Athens we live as we please, and yet are just as ready to encounter every legitimate danger.   
  
"In generosity we are equally singular, acquiring our friends by conferring, not receiving, favors. Yet, of course, the doer of the favor is the firmer friend of the two, in order by continued kindness to keep the recipient in his debt; while the debtor feels less keenly from the very consciousness that the return he makes will be a repayment, not a free gift, and it is only the Athenians who, fearless of consequences, confer their benefits not from calculations of expediency, but in the confidence of liberality.   
  
"In short, I say that as a city we are the school of **Hellas**; while I doubt if the world can produce a man who is equal to so many emergencies where he has only himself to depend upon, and who is graced by so happy a versatility as the Athenian . . . For Athens alone of her contemporaries is found when tested to be greater than her reputation, and alone gives no occasion to her assailants to blush at the antagonist by whom they have been worsted, or to her subjects to question her title by merit to rule. Rather, the admiration of the present and succeeding ages will be ours, since we have not left our power without witness, but have shown it by mighty proofs; and far from needing a Homer for our panegyrist, or another poet whose verses might charm for the moment only for the impression which they gave, to melt at the touch of fact, we have forced every sea and land to be the highway of our daring, and everywhere, whether for evil or for good, have left imperishable monuments behind us. Such is the Athens for which these men, in the assertion of their resolve not to lose her, nobly fought and died; and well may every one of their survivors be ready to suffer in her cause.   
  
"If I have dwelt at some length upon the character of our country, it has been to show that our stake in the struggle is not the same as theirs who have no such blessings to lose, and also that the praise of the men over whom I am now speaking might be confirmed by definite proofs. My speech is now largely complete; for the Athens that I have celebrated is only what the heroism of these and others like them have made her, men whose fame, unlike that of most Hellenes, will be found to be only proportionate to what they deserve. And if a test of worth be wanted, it is to be found in their last scene, and this not only in the cases in which it set the final seal upon their merit, but also in those in which it gave the first intimation of their having any. For there is justice in the claim that steadfastness in his country's battles should be as a cloak to cover a man's other imperfections, since the good more than outweighed his demerits as an individual. . . . And while committing to hope the uncertainty of final success, in the business before them they thought fit to act boldly and trust in themselves. Thus choosing to die resisting, rather than to live submitting.   
  
"So died these men as became Athenians. You, their survivors, must be determined to have as unfaltering a resolution in the field, though you may pray that it may have a happier outcome. . . . You must yourselves realize the power of Athens, and feed your eyes upon her from day to day, till the love of her fills your hearts; and then when all her greatness shall break upon you, you must reflect that it was by courage, sense of duty, and a keen feeling of honor in action that men were enabled to win all this, and that no personal failure in an enterprise could make them consent to deprive their country of their bravery except as a sacrifice of the most serious contribution they could offer.   
  
"…Take these as your model, and recognize that happiness comes from freedom and freedom comes from courage; never decline the dangers of war. For it is not the miserable who have the most reason to risk their lives; they have nothing to hope for: instead, it is they to whom continued life may bring reverses as yet unknown, and to whom a fall, if it came, would be most tremendous in its consequences.…   
  
"Comfort, therefore, not **condolence**, *(an expression of sympathy)*is what I have to offer to the parents of the dead who may be here. Numberless are the chances to which, as they know, the life of man is subject; but fortunate indeed are they who draw their lot a death so glorious as that which has caused your mourning, and to whom life has been so exactly measured as to terminate in the happiness in which it has been passed.   
  
"…My task is now finished.…If deeds be in question, those who are here interred have received part of their honors already, and for the rest, their children will be brought up till manhood at the public expense: thus the state offers a valuable prize as the garland of victory in this race of valor, for the reward both of those who have fallen and their survivors. And where the rewards for merit are greatest, there the best citizens are found.   
  
"And now that you have brought to a close your **lamentations** *(passionate weeping)*for your relatives, you may depart."

**Vocabulary**

The vocabulary listed below represent terms that may or may not be familiar. For your city of focus, locate the two words in content and complete the chart below.

**Tyranny - Sparta**

**Messes - Sparta**

**Sway - Rome**

**Magnanimous - Rome**

**Imitators - Athens**

**Antagonists – Athens**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Word | Write the line number where the word is located. | Infer, from context, what the word might mean. | Using a thesaurus, list synonyms. (at least 3) | Rewrite the sentence that your word is in but this time, use your own words! (Use your synonyms to help you!) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |